

Dheerkot Tourist Resort

Follow-up Monitoring Tour Report Regarding project “Development of Dheerkot Tourist Resort”

The findings of the monitoring visit were already circulated to Tourism Department vide letter No.P&D/M&E/707-12/2016 dated 17-05-2016 (Annex-A) while the response from the Tourism Department is also annexed as Annex-B:

A follow up visit was conducted on 30-07-2016 and the findings of follow-up visit are as under:

A. Completed Work:

- As per APO and ADP 2016-17, the project is 100% completed in June 2016.
- Tourist Hut, Dormitory, Cafeteria Buildings were completed in 2013 and subsequently handed over to the Tourism Department lying idle and still unused for the last three and half years.

B. Work in Progress

- The construction work of the following buildings is still under progress as summarized in the below table:

(Rs. In Million)

S#	Item	Approved Estimated cost in PC-I	Work order Amount	Expenditure up to 6/2016	Physical Progress	Remarks
1	10 Bedroom Motel at Dheerkot	12.220	1 st work order Rs.9.812 million 2 nd work order Rs.7.456 million	6.30 million 12.50 million Total = 18.80	70 %	In ADP 2016-17 financial progress is 100% with zero allocation.
2	Small Museum at Neela Butt	4.200	7.456	5.5 million	50%	

Tourism Motel

1. For construction of Tourism Motel, 2nd work order amounting Rs.7.4 million was awarded to Raja Shahid Farooq dated 24-12-2014 for completion of remaining work in 24 months. As per MB work done recorded is Rs.12.520 million i.e., almost Rs.5.1 million amount is excess of work order amount (copy of MB Annex- C).
2. Vide letter No. 140804 dated 22-06-2016 (Annex-D), the Tourism department granted admin approval of Rs.19.85 million for construction of 10 bedrooms motel building at Dheerkot without considering provision of PC-I and work order amount, i.e., Rs.12.2 million and Rs.7.4 million respectively.

Small Museum at Neela Butt

Work on Museum is almost 50% completed with expenditure of Rs.5.5 million ending June 2016 against PC-I provision of Rs.4.2 million and work order amount Rs.7.456 million. The project is closed as reflected in ADP 2016-17 having zero allocation.

Technical Aspects:

1. It is observed that in work order of tourist motel and dormitory of Dheerkot Rest House iron trusses were proposed but on site wooden trusses were used with very high cost as compared to the wooden trusses. Similarly, in work order block masonry is proposed but sub-standard bricks were used.

Deviation Amount in Roof Trusses

Work order amount (Rs.)	Work done amount as per MB (Rs.)	%age Excess
2,31,723	11,12,180	379%

2. Due to massive honey combing and use of sub-standard material wear and tear has occurred in the dormitory, cafeteria and recreational activities etc.

3. The executing department completely ignored the recommendations of P&DD monitoring report dated 17-05-2016 and did not improve the quality of work as per engineering standards.
4. It was observed that the condition / quality of physical work done was the same as mentioned in the previous monitoring report.

Small Museum at Dheerkot



Incomplete and sub-standard work at Small museum Neela Butt

Motel at Dheerkot



Incomplete and sub-standard work at Dheerkot

Recommendations

Generally the case can be termed as the worst example of violating law, procedures excess payment than the work order, work order over and above the PC-I provision, change of specification without approval of competent authority and low quality works. Other specific recommendations are given below:

1. A policy decision should promptly be taken to utilize the completed building since long (Tourism Hut, Dormitory, and Cafeteria) kept idle and unutilized despite the completion in 2013.
2. A committee should be constituted to ascertain the matter of excess payment of Rs.5.1 million against tourist motel, made to the contractor Raja Shahid Farooq Builders from work order amount and PC-I provision.
3. A thorough investigation should be made to find the reasons and justification for:
 - a. *Granting illegitimate admin approval by Tourism department of Rs.19.8 million for construction of tourist motel ignoring PC-I provision of Rs.12.2 million.*
 - b. *Against prevailing rules, excess payment as per MB recorded for tourism motel Dheerkot by PWD of Rs.12.500 million against work order amount of Rs.7.4 million.*
 - c. *Closure of project from ADP without physical completion of Museum Building Neela Butt and tourist motel at Dheerkot.*
4. Follow Standard Operating Procedure for handing-taking over and documentation of the assets received from executing agency/contractor. The department should avoid verbal handing-taking over process.
5. The Tourism department should actively engage technical staff for continue monitoring and mid-course correction of ongoing projects.
6. Other recommendations already given in monitoring report circulated vide letter No.P&DD/M&E/707-12/2016 dated 17-05-2016 are also need complete compliance by the department.

Reporting Team (P&DD)

Name	Designation	Signature	Date
Raja Manzoor Hussain	Chief (M&E)		
Engr. Ahtesham Altaf	Assistant Director		